COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF BORDER GUARDS' TRAINING IN UKRAINE AND INDIA

Nataliya BHINDER*

*Bohdan Khmelnytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine, Khmelnytskyi, Ukraine

Abstract: *An increase in threats to Ukraine's security has been observed since 2014 and that fact shows the significant role of border agency and professionalism of border guards to ensure security for further economic and socio-political development. This raises the issue of improvement of border guards' training in Ukraine. The priority national interest of Ukraine in the sphere of foreign policy and military development is to deepen the strategic partnership between Ukraine and NATO. But it is important to research the experience of countries facing similar security threats, including border threats and having common issues in the sphere of economics belong to the group of developing countries. The task is to investigate positive foreign experience of border guards' training and elaborate recommendations for creative and partial implementation some aspects in Ukraine.*

1. INTRODUCTION

According to the Law of Ukraine On National Security ratified in 2018 the notion of national security means protection of state sovereignty, territory integrity, democratic constitutional order and other vital important state interests from real and potential threats both military and non-military (Verkhovna Rada Ukrainy: 2018). State policy in the sphere of security and defense concerns the protection of human rights, safe living conditions of citizens, democratic values of society, welfare and sustainable development, constitutional order, sovereignty, territorial integrity, and inviolability. Regarding this, the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine plays a significant role in the sphere of national security being an essential component of the sector of national security and defense (Verkhovna Rada Ukrainy: 2015). And it is obvious that the effectiveness of

professional performance of border guards depends entirely on their level of professional competence. Thus, currently, considering the profile of threats facing Ukraine, including those at the state border, border guards' training is a mandatory condition to ensure national security. Regarding the necessity of rapid changes in the sphere of military education, Ukrainian experts should pay attention to the foreign experience of countries fighting similar border threats and elaborate steps how to implement this experience creatively in the system of professional training of border guards.

2. METHODS

The current study used a wide range of methods to conduct deep and thorough comparative analysis in the sphere of professional training of border guards. All methods belong to two groups - qualitative and quantitative.

Among qualitative methods the following ones were used:
- analysis of official documents regulating the system of education in general and in certain educational establishment (Vasiuk: 2008);
- analysis of academic sources (Vasiuk: 2008, Gale: 2015, Rickinson and May: 2009, Davies: 2000) including the study of publications related to military education, psychology, politics, national security of the country. It is resulted in the synthesis of best results and testing the theory of comparative research;
- observation of the phenomenon including ordinary, inclusive, intensive and extensive (Vasiuk: 2008, Rickinson and May: 2009, Davies: 2000);
- conversation and interview with participants of the process of professional training (Vasiuk: 2008, Rickinson and May: 2009, Davies: 2000);
- method of scientific description of information (Vulfson: 2002);
- comparative method (Vasiuk: 2008) being a concluding method of comparative research to make proper conclusions and to explain the efficiency of changes;
- holistic method which describes the links between education and social process (Shykla: 1983);
- social and anthropological analysis is oriented towards microstudy of certain phenomenon (Shykla: 1983);
- historical and political analysis (Shykla: 1983, Vasiuk: 2008) relevant to the investigation of

historical and geopolitical preconditions of border guards' training;

- descriptive method (Hantrais: 1995);
- inductive and deductive methods (Hantrais: 1995);
- cross-analysis (Vulfson: 2002) to explain differences of the phenomenon;
- demonstration method (Hantrais: 1995) to confirm the theory being studied;
- forecasting methods (Vulfson: 2002) to describe the possibilities of implementation of findings and to describe the prospects of further study.

Besides, quantitative methods were widely used. They were the following:

- analysis of statistical data that characterize the current state of education (Vasiuk: 2008). According to Kazamias (2009) it helps to form further regulating norms;
- mathematical methods of data processing (Vasiuk: 2008);
- structural method that means the simultaneous analysis of units (Vasiuk: 2008);
- constructive and genetical method (Vasiuk: 2008) that means the analysis of changes within the phenomenon being studied in general and in its certain components;

- method of additional analysis of data concerning the process of follow-up review in order to retest results (Arber: 2006, Gale: 2015);
- method of initial information collecting (during the interview, etc) (Gale: 2015);
- sample approach (Gale: 2015) used to select experts with special knowledge for interview to determine central topic and to interpret results;
- method of studying of selected object (Gale: 2015, Hakim: 2000) which is transparent, stable and objective analysis to describe causes and methods of phenomenon development in the current context. In the sphere of the study of professional training of border guards it helps to interpret and compare the activities of border agencies and higher military educational establishments of two countries, to explain the peculiarities of foreign practices;
- juxtaposition (Hantrais: 1995) to find matchings between data in accordance with the chosen criterion.

Moreover, it is necessary to follow the requirement of Gale

(2015) Hakim (2000) and Hantrais (1995) to use these methods in combination (so-called combined approach) for deeper analysis of the problem.

According to Hans (2012), there is no universal method to conduct comparative research; at the same time, Chopyk (2016) admits that selection of methods should be adequate to the topic of research and correspond to processes and phenomena being analyzed.

3. DISCUSSION

3.1. Criteria to select countries for comparative analysis

The main problem to conduct comparative research is to select proper countries for comparative analysis as, according to Hantrais (1995), the comparability of objects influences the quality of research. Of course, in fact, there are no ideally comparable objects. Even the EU countries differ from each other in economic and social development, systems of cultural values, military potential, etc.

While choosing countries for comparative analysis, we used the findings of Green (2003) and Smelser (1976) who admitted that main criteria for selection are the following: compliance to the theoretical problem; causal linkage with phenomenon being analysed; availability of data. These criteria allowed to compare at different levels.

Detailed analysis of the selection of countries is described by Vulfson (2002). These factors are the following: countries used to occupy the territory of one country; countries located in one continent; countries having similar population; countries characterizing by certain economic and socio-political indices; countries having a similar system of state government; countries having similar religious, cultural or language peculiarities.

Also, Vulfson (2002) determines the group of educational indices: level of centralization/decentralization of system of education; similarity of historical and cultural traditions; factual basis to compare the set of factors; peculiarities of science and technology development; reforms within the system of education; ways of reproduction of labor force; economic efficiency of education (duration, costs, etc.).

Besides while conducting comparative analysis in the sphere of border guards' training it is necessary to consider security factors of countries being compared: military alliance

membership, level of military and economic development, ranking of military power, amount of military budget, content of military doctrine determining security vector of national policy, and security threats including at the border, existence of border agencies, diverse borderline. Table 1 shows the criteria to prove the necessity to compare border guards' training in Ukraine and India and their interpretation.

Table 1. Criteria of comparison border guards' training in Ukraine and India

Criterion of comparison	Ukraine	Republic of India
Economic and sociopolitical development	Developing country	Developing country
Military budget	3 % of GDP (1)	2.5 % of GDP (1)
Ranking of the army	30th in the world 10th in Europe (2)	4th in the world (2)
Border agencies (3)	State Border Guard Service of Ukraine which includes Marine Guard	Border Security Force Assam Rifles Indian Coast Guard Indo-Tibetan Border Police Sashastra Seema Bal
Length of the state border	6 993 km including 1355 km of marine borders (4)	15 107 km including 7 517 km of marine borders (5)
Alliance membership	No	No
Diverse terrain	Yes	Yes
Multinational population, especially in border areas	Yes	Yes
Security threats	Terrorism Separatist movement Armed aggression Hybrid war (6)	Terrorism Separatism Armed aggression Nuclear threat Biological threat Chemical threat Hybrid war (7)
Threats at the border	Penetration of armed crime groups Separatism Low-intensity conflict Arms smuggling	Separatists movements Low-intensity conflict Poaching Penetration of armed groups Arms smuggling Trafficking in counterfeit

Criterion of comparison	Ukraine	Republic of India
	Trafficking in goods Illegal migration Transborder crimes Increase of transborder movements of people, vehicles, and goods Poaching in exclusive marine zone Line of control with occupied area (6)	currency Drugs trafficking Natural calamities Border clashes Line of control Rough terrain and porous border areas (7)
Border conflicts/occupied areas	Yes	Yes
Fenced border (in some border areas)	Yes	Yes
Presence of shared and undemarcated borders	Yes	Yes
Military doctrine – main mission	Ensuring military security and prevention of exterior aggression (Verkhovna Rada Ukrainy: 2015)	Safeguarding the nation from any type of internal and external threats/aggression (Ministry of Defense, Government of India: 2017)
Higher military educational establishments for training border guards	Yes	Yes
Agency-specific training centers	Yes	Yes

Thus, we can conclude that Ukraine and India have common features of national security and threats profile. Also, both countries have separate educational establishments for training border guards. The problem is to analyze the systems of border guards' training, find out common features and reveal differences.

Let us analyze the in accordance with specified components.

3.2. Agency-specific educational establishments and training centers

Both countries have higher military educational establishments and training centers oriented

towards professional training of border guards. In Ukraine within the structure of the border agency there is one higher military educational establishment (Bohdan Khmelnytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine) and 3 training centers (Ihor Momot Main Center for Training of Personnel of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine, Canine Training Center of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine, Izmail Training Detachment of Marine Guard.

Due to the number of border agencies and strength of personnel there are nine higher military educational establishments training border guards in the Republic of India (Border Security Force Academy, Indo-Tibetan Border Police Academy, Indian Coast Guard Academy, Sashastra Seema Bal, Indraprastha Defense Academy, Chennai Officers Training Academy, Indian Coast Guard Academy, Naval Institute of Aeronautical Technology, National Defense University). Besides India has several training centers for border guards designated to certain border agency.

Thus, Border Security Force includes 10 training centers, Indo-Tibetan Border Police – 1 training center, Assam Rifles – 1 training center and Assam Rifles school, Sashastra Seema Bal – 3 training centers, Indian Coast Guard – 3 naval schools (Ministry of Defence: 2016).

3.3. Stages of professional training and their duration

In Ukraine, basic training lasts 8 weeks, while in India it lasts 40-100 weeks that is more than five times. At the same time, training of junior specialist at the Ukrainian training centers lasts up to 3 years depending on specialty. Bachelor's training at the Bohdan Khmelnytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine lasts 4 years (Bohdan Khmelnytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine: n.d.), in Indian higher military educational establishments cadets obtain bachelor's degree during 3 years on the basis of complete secondary education and 1 year on the basis of higher education at the civilian establishment.

Master's training in Ukraine lasts for 1-2 years, in India master's training which is called professional military education lasts 1 year (Sen: 2013, Pama: 2008). Besides in Indian educational establishments and training centers certified courses

are widely used as pre-employment and advanced training for border guards on active duty.

3.4. Forms of instruction

In Ukraine daytime instruction is applied for all stages of training, correspondence instruction is partially used during master's training (Bohdan Khmelnytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine: n.d., Poliuk: 2015). In Indian higher educational establishments, daytime instruction is most common, but distance and correspondence instruction are also often applied during bachelor's and master's training (Sen: 2013, Singh: 2015).

Many advanced training courses are taught online or distantly. In Ukraine, the system of distant education is not highly developed, but its benefits are obvious. The establishments are beginning to move in this direction despite these courses are currently used as voluntarily self-development programs.

3.5. Theoretical and methodological principles of border guards' training

In Ukraine competence-based (Chmyr: 2011, Veretilnyk: 2016, Torichnyi: 2016, Yevsiukov:

2006), activity (Demianiuk: 2014, Poliuk: 2015) and personal-centered (Voitsekhivskyi: 2011, Torichnyi: 2016) approaches are adopted in the process of professional training of border guards while in India competence-based, activity, andragogical, ethnoaxiological approaches are applied (Aggarwal: 1986, Berestetska: 2016, Banerjee: 2003, Bhatia: 1987, Chakraborty: 2003, Dobhal: 2016, Pama: 2008).

The difference is that system of training of border guards' in Ukraine is oriented towards the formation of professional skills during training period at the educational establishment under the supervision of an instructor, while Indian peculiarities mean that border guards obtain professional skills and abilities to study during training period as well as in the workplace independently.

Besides, this be explained that Indian cadets are a bit older when entering higher educational establishments and more intrinsically motivated due to highly competitive environment.

3.6. Number of cadets in the study group

An average number of cadets in the study group at the Bohdan

Khmelnytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine is 25-30 (Bohdan Khmelnytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine: n.d.).

This study group can be divided into two subgroups for practical lessons. Study groups at the Indian educational establishments can vary from 5 students doing the master's course up to 60 cadets at the bachelor's program (Indian Coast Guard: n.d., ITBP Academy: n.d., Join Indian Coast Guard: n.d., Pama: 2008).

3.7. Organization of professional training

In Ukraine we observe fixed periodization of professional training stages (Hriaznov and Usachyk: 2011), absence of flexibility of forms of instruction (Havriluk: 2017), underdeveloped algorithm of system of rewards and encouragement, absence of clearly defined system of trainings and courses in accordance with the needs of the agency and cadets themselves (Bohdaniuk: 2013), absence of programs of academic mobility.

At the same time the Indian system of border guards' training is characterized by continuity, diversification of specialties (Border Security Force: n.d.), flexibility of forms of instruction (Narang: 1997), wide application of distant learning, sophisticated system of rewards and sanctions, usage of cross-learning, cascade learning, horizontal learning, and microteaching, effective usage of independent and individual work (Berestetska: 2015).

3.8. Forms of the organization of training and teaching methods

At the Bohdan Khmelnytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine instructors preferably use lectures, practical lessons, group, pair, and individual work as these forms of organization of training are provided in the regulating documents and methodical recommendations (Borovyk: 2018).

Main forms of organization of training at the Indian educational establishments are the following: lectures, practical and demonstration lessons, group, pair, independent and individual work, distant learning, cascade learning, horizontal learning, cross learning, capsule courses (Center for Civil Society: 2016, Cheney *et al.,* 2005, Nordic Recognition Information Centres: 2006, Torichnyi and Bhinder: 2017).

It reflects greater flexibility of instructors at the Indian educational establishments and their broader set of forms used in the process of border guards' training, but due to a large number of cadets in study groups, active methods of teaching are less common. Innovation teaching methods used at the Indian higher military educational establishments are the following: independent war games (Sharma: 2017, SSB Academy: n.d.), project method, research method, methods of psychological influence (Singh: 2005, Sujatha Devi: 2014), flipped classroom (Srivastava: 2014), simulation modeling (Chauhan: 2013).

At the same time, instructors in Ukraine widely apply active and interactive teaching methods except traditional methods (explanatory, dialogue, illustration), being active participants of the training process themselves.

3.9. Teaching tools

When we speak of teaching tools used during border guards' training in Ukraine, we mean methodical manuals, textbooks, technical aids, demonstration military equipment (Chmyr: 2011, Havriluk: 2017, Torichnyi: 2016).

In India a range of tools is a little bit wider, and they are the following: textbooks, computer means of diagnostics and learning control, video materials, audio textbooks, electronic database, programs for distant learning (Border Security Force; n.d., ITBP Academy: n.d., Indian Coast Guard: n.d.), military equipment and simulation model (Chauhan: 2013), information and communication technologies, Internet, massive open online resources (Venkata Reddy: 2002, Singh: 2010).

Of course, some advanced tools are used by Ukrainian instructors, but it is not on a regular basis (Voitsekhivskyi: 2013). At the same time in India, we notice that the tools mentioned above are in high demand due to larger study groups and lack of instructors. Indian experience shows that advanced technical tools help to improve cost-efficiency of training process over the long term

3.10. Assessment and monitoring of training

At the Bohdan Khmelnytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine qualification, ongoing, topical, modular, and final control of learning performance is adopted

(Yahupov: 2002, Biliavets: 2018). Indian higher military educational establishments and training centers use input, ongoing and final control. Besides, in India exterior assessment of learning performance is expected (Torichnyi and Bhinder: 2017, Ministry of Defence, 2016).

3.11. Content of border guards' training

Contents of border guards' training in Ukraine and India face the biggest difference. Firstly, in Ukraine contents of training is divided into two parts: general training and professional training. General training makes about 28.5 % of the total time devoted to training and it includes the following subjects: Ukrainian language, History of Ukraine, Computer science, Philosophy, Foreign language, Sociology, Ethics and esthetics, Principles of management, Pedagogics, Psychology, Political and economic systems, Principles of state and law, Principles of natural and technical sciences.

Professional training makes respectively 71.5 % of the total learning time including apprenticeship. Professional subjects at the Bohdan Khmelnytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine may vary in spite of specialty.

Some of them are the following: Tactics of border service, Border control, Mechanical means of border control, Fire training, Physical training, Engineering training, Automotive industry training, Information and telecommunication systems, Moral and psychological support, Tactical medicine, Administrative activity, Topography (Bohdan Khmel-nytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine: n.d., Borovyk: 2018, Chmyr: 2011, Havriluk: 2017, Hriaznov and Usachyk: 2011, State Border Guard Service of Ukraine: n.d).

Contents of border guards' training in Indian military educational establishments consists of the obligatory general professional block which is common for all border agencies and agency-specific subjects depending on the tasks designated to personnel (Bhinder: 2017).

Obligatory general professional block includes Drill training, Marksmanship, Physical training, Military tactics, Driving, Border management, Counter-terrorism operations, Counter-insurgency

operations, Joint operations, Service regulations, Military law, English, Hindi, History of India, Military campaigns of India (Bhinder: 2017, Border Security Force (n.d.).). Agency-specific subjects are the following: Border Security Force (Use of means of fortification, Use of heavy weapons, Horse and camel riding, Survival in swamps, Solo patrolling) (Border Security Force (n.d.).); Indo-Tibetan Border Police (Hand-to-hand fighting (judo), Horse riding, Chinese language Mandarin, Tibetan language) (CNTV: 2017, ITBP: n.d., ITBP Academy: n.d.); Assam Rifles (Jungle war, Horse riding, Survival in mountains and jungles, Use of hot-air balloon) (Assam Rifles: n.d., Sharma: 2001, Talukdar: 2010); Sashastra Seema Bal (Reconnaissance, Rescue operations, Escort of civil populations through mountains, Work with local communities and indigenous people, Smuggling prevention, Detecting of counterfeit notes) (Chakravorty: 2016, Sashastra Seema Bal: n.d., SSB Academy: n.d.); Indian Coast Guard (Poaching prevention, Smuggling prevention, Protection of inclusive marine economic zone) (Indian Coast Guard: n.d., Join Indian Coast Guard: n.d.).

3.12. Output level of professional competence

According to the tasks facing the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine and analysis of professional training at the Bohdan Khmelnytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Academy the output level of professional competence of border guards is oriented towards appropriate level of development of skills, personal qualities, service readiness, professional mobility during solving professional tasks in peacetime and while conducting combat operations at the border area.

The output level of professional competence of Indian border guards means a high level of professional qualification, acquisition of professional skills, modern and effective methods of professional tasks solving, and implies the readiness to perform a professional agency - specific activity with high productivity considering security factors.

4. CONCLUSIONS

Thus, professional training of border guards in Ukraine and India have the single task – to prepare experts in the sphere of border security to effective performance

of professional activities and to train them to counteract the existing threats in the border area. Having analyzed the training process in both countries, we found out a wide range of similarities which concern stages of training, usage of conventional methodological approaches, traditional teaching methods and regular tools.

However, the main differences touch upon implementation of innovative methods. Indian higher military educational establishments and training centers are more flexible to use various forms of instruction, having applied certified training courses including capsule course in civilian educational establishments, formally adopted independent and individual work, distant learning, cascade learning, horizontal learning, and cross-learning.

Also, the difference is manifested in teaching methods choice: in Ukraine instruction is more concentrated upon active and interactive methods, while in India flipped classroom, simulation modeling, and proactive methods are used. The main difference is in the duration of basic training being an evidence that in Ukraine it is more like induction course but in India basic training, lasting from 40 to 100 weeks, is full daytime training of border guards to perform professional tasks. The content of training also differs. In Ukraine, it includes general fundamental and professional subjects while in India border guards' training is narrow specialization oriented towards specific agency tasks.

Having studied the problem and considering the security issues Ukraine has been facing since 2014, it is necessary to say that some steps are taken in the direction to strengthen military component of border guards' training, but still some improvements are required. They are the following:

1. Further modernization of system of professional training at the Bohdan Khmelnytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine in accordance with current standards, adoption of advanced foreign experience.

2. Extension of usage of innovative teaching methods including those oriented towards independent learning of cadets.

3. Development of online learning environment to obtain additional knowledge or refresh skills.

4. Wide implementation of innovative teaching tools (information and communication technologies, simulation modeling, etc.).

5. Reformatting of organization of training process, making it more flexible and adjustable.

6. Extension of hours for practical and demonstration lessons, including apprenticeship directly at the border units.

7. Increasing of self-motivation of cadets.

ENDNOTES

[1] Military expenditure (% of GDP), available at https://data.worldbank.org/indicator/ms.mil.xpnd.gd.zs, last retrieved 6 February 2019.

[2] 2018 Military strength ranking, available at https://www.globalfirepower.com/countries-listing.asp, last retrieved 8 February 2019.

[3] List of national border guard agencies, available at https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_national_border_guard_agencies, last retrieved 2 January 2019.

[4] Derzhavnyi kordon Ukrainy (State Border of Ukraine), available at http://proukraine.net.ua/?page_id=243, last retrieved 3 February 2019.

[5] Borders of India, available at https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Borders_of_India, last retrieved 1 February 2019.

[6] Zahrozy natsionalnii i derzhavnii bezpetsi Ukrainy (Threat of national and state security of Ukraine), available at https://ssu.gov.ua/ua/pages/33, last retrieved 8 February 2019.

[7] India facing complex security challenges, threat to territorial integrity, internal stability: Army Chief, available at https://timesofindia.indiatimes.com/india/india-facing-complex-security-challenges-threat-to-territorial-integrity-internal-stability-bipin-rawat/articleshow/67336909.cms, last retrieved 8 February 2019.

REFERENCES

[1].Aggarwal, J. C. (1986). *Theory and Principles of Education: Philosophical and Sociological Bases of Education.* New Delhi: Vikas Publishing House.

[2].Arber, S. (2006). Secondary analysis of survey data*.* In N. Gilbert (Ed.), *Researching social life* (2nd Ed.). London: Sage.

[3].Assam Rifles (n.d.) *Assam Rifles: Role and Tasks*, available at http://assamrifles.gov.in/newwindow.html?2030, last retrieved 29 december 2018.

[4].Banerjee, A. (2003). *Philosophy and Principles of Education*. Kolkata: B B Kundu.

[5].Berestetska, N. V. (2015). Zagalni zasady profesiinoi pidgotovky prykordonnykiv v Respublitsi India: geopolitychnyj aspekt (General principles of professional training of border guards in the Republic of India). *Suchasni informaciini tehnologii ta innovaciini metodyky navchannia v pidgotovtsi fakhivciv: metodologiia, teoriia, dosvid, problemy: Zb. nauk. pr.* 43, pp. 143 – 147.

[6].Berestetska, N. V. (2016). Formuvannia systemy pidgotovky prykordonnykiv v Respublitsi India: istorychni ta socialno-politychni umovy (Formation of system of border guards' training in the Republic of India: historical and socio-political conditions). *Visnyk Cherkaskoho u-tu: naukovyi zhurnal. Ser. «Pedagogichni nauky»*. 11, pp. 12 – 20.

[7].Bhatia, K. K. (1987). *Principles of Education*. New Delhi: Kalyani Publishers.

[8].Bhinder, N. (2017). Content Analysis of professional Training of border guards in the Republic of India. *Studies in Comparative Education*. No 3-4 (33-34), pp. 18-26.

[9].Biliavets, S. Y. (2018). Kontseptualni osnovy formuvannia profesiinoi kompetentnosti maibutnikh ofitseriv-prykordonnykiv u protsesi navchannia viiskovo-spetsialnykh dystsyplin (Conceptual principles of formation of professional competence of future border guard officers in the process of teaching of special military subjects). *Young Scientist*. No 2 (1), pp. 2227 – 232.

[10]. Bohdan Khmelnytskyi National Academy of the State Border Guard Service of Ukraine (n.d.). *Osvitnia dialnist* (Educational activity), available at https://nadpsu.edu.ua/osvita-i-nauka/osvitnia-diialnist/, last retrieved 12 January 2019.

[11]. Bohdaniuk, O. D. (2013). Profesiina kompetentnist maibutnikh ofitseriv-prykordonnykiv – osnova yakisnoi pidhotovky do sluzhbovoi diialnosti (Professional competence of future border guard offciers – basis for efficient training to service activities). *Naukovyi visnyk Uzhhorodskoho natsionalnoho universytetu.* Seriia "Pedahohika, Sotsialna robota". Vyp. 29, pp. 27 – 29.

[12]. Border Security Force (n.d.). *Border Security Force Academy – Birthplace of the Borderman*, available at http://acy.bsf.gov.in, last retrieved 12 December 2018.

[13]. Borovyk, L. (2018). Analiz ta obhruntuvannia struktury metodychnoi systemy formuvannia psykholohichnoi kompetentnosti maibutnikh ofitseriv-prykordonnykiv (Analysis aaand substantiation of structure of methodological system of formation of psychological competence of future border guard officers). *Molod i rynok*, No. 7 (162), pp. 99 – 105.

[14]. Center for Civil Society (2016). *New Education Policy: Principles, Priorities & Practices,* available at http://ccs.in/sites/default/files/attac hments/ccs-nep-brief-jan-2016.pdf, last retrieved 14 January 2019.

[15]. Chakraborty, J. C. (2003). *Modern Education: Its Aims and Principles*. Kolkata: Usha Publishing House.

[16]. Chakravorty A. (2016). Explained: Why was the Sashstra Seema Bal force created? *The Indian Express,* available at http://indianexpress.com/article/ex plained/sashastra-seema-bal-ssb-news/, last retrieved 10 December 2018.

[17]. Chauhan, S. (2013). Enhancing Training Through Use of Simulations. *CLAW Journal*, available at http://www.claws.in/images/journa ls_doc/1394685688Sameer%20Ch auhan%20CJ%20Summer%20201 3.pdf, last retrieved 1 February 2019.

[18]. Cheney, G. R. et al. (2005). *A Profile of the India Education System*. Washington: National Center on Education and the Economy.

[19]. Chmyr, V. M. (2011). Kompetentnisno-orientovanyi pidhid do pidhotovky maibutnikh ofitseriv-prykordonnykiv inzhenernykh spetsialnostei (Competence-based approach to training of future border guard officers of engineering specialities). *Narodna osvita*. Vyp.

2 (14), available at http://www.narodnaosvita.kiev.ua/vupysku/14/statti/chmir.htm, last retrieved 2 February 2019.

[20]. Chopyk Y. (2016). Istoriografiia pedagogichnoi komparatyvistyky: problema metodologii doslidzhennia (Historiography of pedagogical comparative studies: problem of research methodology). *Pedagogical Discourse.* Issue 21, pp. 181 – 187.

[21]. CNTV (2017). *Learning Chinese now compulsory for Indian border police's new recruits*, available at http://en.people.cn/n3/2017/0831/c90777-9262856.html, last retrieved 29 December 2018.

[22]. Davies, P. (2000). The relevance of systematic reviews to educational policy and practice. *Oxford Review of Education*. No 26 (3&4). pp. 365 – 378.

[23]. Demianiuk Y. A. (2014). Formuvannia hotovnosti maibutnikh ofitseriv-prykordonnykiv do organizatorskoi diialnosti yak pedagogichna problema (Formation of readiness of future border guard officers to organization activities as pedagogical problem). *Visnyk Natsionalnoi akademii Derzhavnoi prykordonnoi sluzhby Ukrainy.* Vyp. 3, available at http://nbuv.gov.ua/UJRN/Vnadps_2014_3_5, last retrieved 12 February 2019.

[24]. Dobhal, P. (2016) Education in Indian Army: An Analysis *SOPAAN: A Multidisciplinary Bi-annual e-Journal.* 2(2), available at http://pggc46.ac.in/sopaan_e_journal.aspx, last retrieved 5 February 2019.

[25]. Gale, C. (2015). Research methodology applied to a comparative case study of the deinstitutionalisation of children in Bulgaria and Ukraine. *Scottish Journal of Residential Child Care*. Vol.14, No.3, pp. 85 - 98.

[26]. Green, A. (2003). *Education, Globalisation and the Role of Comparative Research*: Draft Article for London Review of Education. London Review of Education, No. 1 (2), pp. 83-98.

[27]. Hakim, C. (2000). *Research design: Successful designs for social and economic research* (2nd Ed.). London: Routledge.

[28]. Hans, N. (2012). *Comparative education: A Study of Educational Factors and Traditions*. Oxon: Routledge, 2012.

[29]. Hantrais, L. (1995). Comparative Research Methods. *Social Research Update*, Issue 13.

[30]. Havriluk, V. V. (2017). Osoblyvosti navchannia maibutnikh ofitseriv-prykordonnykiv osnov boiovoho zabezpechennia operatyvno-sluzhbovykh dii pidrozdiliv (Peculiarities of teaching of principles of military support of operation and service activitions of units to future border guard officers). *Young Scientist*. No 11 (51), pp. 289 – 294.

[31]. Hriaznov, I. O. and Usachyk, N. M. (2011). Systema formuvannia profesiinoi kompetentnosti maibutnikh ofitseriv-prykordonnykiv u protsesi stazhuvannia v orhanakh Derzhavnoi prykordonnoi sluzhby Ukrainy (System of formation of professional competence of future oborder guard officers during their apprenticeship in organs of the State Border Guard service of Ukraine). *Pedahohichnyi dyskurs*. Vyp. 6, pp. 80 – 86.

[32]. Indian Coast Guard (n.d.). *Indian Coast Guard Mission Statement*, available at http://www.indiancoastguard.nic.in , last retrieved 12 December 2018.

[33]. Indian Coast Guard (n.d.). *Training Overview*, available at https://indiancoastguard.gov.in/content/240_3_Training.aspx, last retrieved 14 December 2018.

[34]. ITBP (n.d.). *The Indo-Tibetan Border Police Force Act, 1992*, available at http://itbpolice.nic.in/itbpwebsite/Documents/ITBP-Act.pdf, last retrieved 18 December 2018.

[35]. ITBP Academy (n.d.). *ITBP Academy Mussoorie*, available at http://itbpacademy.nic.in/aboutus.html, last retrieved 18 December 2018.

[36]. Join Indian Coast Guard (n.d.). *Training of the Coast Guard*, available at http://joinindiancoastguard.gov.in/training.html, last retrieved 11 December 2018.

[37]. Kazamias, A. M. (2009). Forgotten men, forgotten themes: the historical-pholosophical-cultural and liberal humanist motif in comparative education. In R. Cowen, A. M. Kazamias (Eds), *International Handbook of Comparative Education*. Part One. Eds.. Dordrecht-Heidelberg-London-New York, Springer-Science+Business Media, B. V., pp. 37 – 58.

[38]. Ministry of Defence, Government of India (2016). *Annual Report 2015-2016*, available at http://mod.nic.in/sites/default/files/Annual2016.pdf, last retrieved 11 January 2019.

[39]. Ministry of Defense, Government of India (2017). *Joint Doctrine: Indian Armed Forces*. New Delhi: Directorate of Doctrine, Headquarters Integrated Defense Stuff, Ministry of Defense.

[40]. Narang, R. (1997). *Indian Universities and the Future of Adult Education in the Twenty-First Century*. Mumbai: University of Mumbai, Department of Adult & Continuing Education & Extension.

[41]. Nordic Recognition Information Centres (2006). *Report on The System of Education in India*, available at http://norric.org/files/education-systems/India-2006.pdf, last retrieved 3 February 2019.

[42]. Pama, B. (2008). *Paradigm Shift in Training in the Army*. New Delhi: KW Publishers Pvt. Ltd.

[43]. Poliuk, V. S. (2015). Metodolohichni zasady metodyky zahalnoviskovoi pidhotovky maibutnikh ofitseriv-prykordonnykiv u vyshchomu navchalnomu zakladi (Methodological principles of methods of general military training of future border guard officers at the higher educational establishment). *Visnyk Natsionalnoi akademii Derzhavnoi prykordonnoi sluzhby Ukrainy*. Vyp. 5, available at http://nbuv.gov.ua/UJRN/Vnadps_2015_2_14, last retrieved 1 February 2019.

[44]. Rickinson, M. A and May, H. (2009). *Comparative study of methodological approaches to reviewing literature*. Heslington: The Higher Education Academy.

[45]. Sashastra Seema Bal (n.d.). *Brief Introduction of S.S.B*, available at http://ssbacademy.co.in/history.aspx, last retrieved 20 December 2018.

[46]. Sen, G. (2013). Professional Military Education in India: The emerging Scenario. *Indian Higher Education: Perception, Policies and Practices.* 1(1), pp. 44 – 60.

[47]. Sharma, A. K. (2001). The Assam Rifles. *Military and Defence*. 638, available at http://www.ipcs.org/article/military-and-defence/the-assam-rifles-638.html, last retrieved 11 December 2018.

[48]. Sharma, G. R. (2017). Professional Military Education and Producing Thought Leaders for the Army. *CLAWS*. 1774, available at http://www.claws.in/1774/professional-military-education-and-producing-thought-leaders-for-the-army-lt-gen-rakesh-sharma-

retd.html, last retrieved 8 January 2019.

[49]. Shykla S. (1983). Comparative Education: An Indian Perspective. *Comparative Education Review*. Vol. 27, No. 2, pp. 246 – 258.

[50]. Singh, D. (2005). Rejuvenating Indian Army Education And Training. *Delhi Business Review*. 6(1), pp. P. 27 – 44.

[51]. Singh, H. (2010). Professional Military Education: The First Steps in the Indian Context. *IDSA Issue Brief*. Available at https://www.files.ethz.ch/isn/1379 57/PME.HarinderSingh.Brief_.pdf, last retrieved 6 February 2019.

[52]. Smelser, N. (1976). *Comparative Methods in the Social Sciences*, New Jersey, Prentice Hall.

[53]. Srivastava, K. (2014). Role of Flipped Classroom in Education. *PARIPEX - Indian Journal of Research*. Vol. 3, Issue 4, pp. P. 81 – 83.

[54]. SSB Academy (n.d.) Making of an Officer, available at http://ssbacademy.co.in/making-of-an-officer.aspx, last retrieved 19 December 2018.

[55]. State Border Guard Service of Ukraine (n.d.). *z 2014 – posylennia viiskovoi komponenty v systemi vidomstva, adaptatsiia isnuiochoi systemy do umov osoblyvoho period (vedennia boiovykh dii)* (since 2014 – strengthening of military component within the system of agency, adaptation of existing system to conditions of special period (conduct of combat operations), available at https://dpsu.gov.ua/ua/z-2014-posilennya-viyskovoi-komponenti-v-sistemi-vidomstva-adaptaciya-isnuyuchoi-sistemi-do-umov-osoblivogo-periodu-vedennya-boyovih-diy/, last retrieved 30 December 2018.

[56]. Sujatha Devi, A. (2014). *Active Learning Models for Effective Teaching*. Hyderabad. UGC-Academic Staff College, Jawaharlal Nehru Technological University, available at http://jntuhhrdc.in/docs/Mini%20p roject.pdf, last retrieved 9 February 2019.

[57]. Talukdar, S. (2010). Frontier Force. *Frontline*. No. 27(12), available at http://www.frontline.in/static/html/ fl2712/stories/2010061827120890 0.htm, last retrieved 14 December 2018.

[58]. Torichnyi, O. V. (2016). Formuvannia professiinoi kompetentnosti maibutnikh ofitseriv-prykordonnykiv

zasobamy proektnoi diialnosti (Formation of professional competence of future border guard officers using means of project-based activities). *Visnyk Natsionalnoi akademii Derzhavnoi prykordonnoi sluzhby Ukrainy.* Vyp. 1, available at http://nbuv.gov.ua/UJRN/Vnadped _2016_1_10, last retrieved 2 February 2019.

[59]. Torichnyi, O. V. and Bhinder, N. V. (2017). Sutnist profesiinoi pidhotovky prykordonnykiv u Respublitsi India (Essence of professional training of border guards in the Republic of India). In *Osvitnio-naukove zabezpechennja diialnosti skladovyh sektoru bezpeky i oborony Ukrainy: tezy X Vseukrainskoi naukovo-praktychnoi konferencii.* Khmelnytskyi: Vyd-vo NADPSU, pp. 379 – 380.

[60]. Vasiuk, O. V. (2008). *Porivnialna pedagogika (Comparative education)*. Kyiv, NAU.

[61]. Venkata Reddy, K. (2002). Changing Attitudes To Education In India. New Delhi. Atlantic Publishers and Distributors.

[62]. Veretilnyk, V. V. (2016). Viiskovo-spetsialna kompetentnist ofitseriv-pprykordonnykiv yak predmet naukovykh doslidzhen (Military special competence of future border guard officers as a subject of scientific investigations). *Scientific Review*. No 11 (32), available at http://naukajournal.org/index.php/ naukajournal/article/view/1045, last retrieved 15 January 2019.

[63]. Verkhovna Rada Ukrainy (2015). *Ukaz Pesidenta Ukrainy Pro rishennia Rady natsionalnoi bezpeky i oborony Ukrainy vid 2 veresnia 2015 roky "Pro novu redaktsiiu Voyennoi doktryny Ukrainy* (Decree of President of Ukraine On decision of National Security and Defense Council of Ukraine from 2 September 2015 "On new version of Military Doctrine of Ukraine", available at https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/sho w/555/2015, last retrieved 11 January 2019.

[64]. Verkhovna Rada Ukrainy (2018). *Zakon Ukrainy Pro natsionalnu bezpeku Ukrainy* (Law of Ukraine On National security of Ukraine). *Vidomosti Verkhovnoi Rady*, No 31, available at https://zakon.rada.gov.ua/laws/sho w/2469-19, last retrieved 12 February 2019.

[65]. Voitsekhivskyi, O. (2011). Osoblyvosti pidhotovky maibutnikh ofitseriv-prykordonnykiv do profesiinoi diialnosti v punktakh propusku

cherez derzhavnyi kordon (Peculiarities of training of future border guard offciers in border crossing through the state border). *Molod i rynok*, No. 2 (73), pp. 35 – 139.

[66]. Voitsekhivskyi, O. (2013). Udoskonalennia pidhotovky maibutnikh ofitseriv-prykordonnykiv zasobamy modelnoho pidhodu v pobudovi

[67]. Vulfson, B. L. (2002). Metody sravnitelno-pedagogicheskikh issledovanii (Methods of comparative education researches). *Pedagogika*. No 2, pp. 70-80.

[68]. Yahupov, V. V. (2002). Pedahohika (Pedagogics). Kyiv: Lybid.

[69]. Yevsiukov, O. F. (2006). *Pedahohichni umovy formuvannia profesiinoi kompetentnosti*

komputerno-oriyentovanoho navchalnoho seredovyshcha (Improvement of training of future border guard officers using means of modelling approach in the process of designing of computer-based learning environment). *Naukovyi visnyk Skhidnoyevropeiskoho natsionalnoho universytetu imeni Lesi Ukrainky*. No 7, pp. 32-36.

maibutnih ofitseriv u navchalnomu procesi vyshchoho viiskovoho navchalnoho zakladu (Pedagogical conditions of formation of professional competence of future officers during educational process at the higher military educational establishmnet) (Doctoral disseration). Kharkiv: Hryhorii Skovoroda Kharkiv National Pedagogical University.